Testing general relativity via observations of black hole surroundings

Éric Gourgoulhon

Laboratoire Univers et Théories (LUTH) CNRS / Observatoire de Paris / Université Paris Diderot Paris Sciences et Lettres Research University 92190 Meudon, France

http://luth.obspm.fr/~luthier/gourgoulhon/

based on a collaboration with

Philippe Grandclément, Carlos Herdeiro, Zakaria Meliani, Jérôme Novak, Thibaut Paumard, Guy Perrin, Eugen Radu, Claire Somé, Odele Straub and Frédéric H. Vincent

CoCoNuT Meeting 2016

Valencia, Spain 16 December 2016

Éric Gourgoulhon (LUTH)

Testing GR via BH observations

- A new observational era
- 2 Testing general relativity with black holes
- Boson stars
- 4 Black holes with scalar hair
- 5 Conclusion and future prospects

Outline

A new observational era

- 2 Testing general relativity with black holes
- Boson stars
- 4 Black holes with scalar hair
- 5 Conclusion and future prospects

Can we see a black hole from the Earth?



Angular diameter of the silhouette of a Schwarzschild BH of mass M seen from a distance d:

$$\Theta = 6\sqrt{3}\,\frac{GM}{c^2 d} \simeq 2.60 \frac{2R_{\rm S}}{d}$$

Image of a thin accretion disk around a Schwarzschild BH [Vincent, Paumard, Gourgoulhon & Perrin, CQG 28, 225011 (2011)]

Éric Gourgoulhon (LUTH)

Testing GR via BH observations

Valencia, 16 Dec. 2016 4 / 34

A B A A B A A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A

Can we see a black hole from the Earth?



Angular diameter of the silhouette of a Schwarzschild BH of mass M seen from a distance d:

$$\Theta = 6\sqrt{3}\,\frac{GM}{c^2 d} \simeq 2.60 \frac{2R_{\rm S}}{d}$$

Largest black holes in the Earth's sky :

Sgr A* : $\Theta = 53 \ \mu as$ M87 : $\Theta = 21 \ \mu as$ M31 : $\Theta = 20 \ \mu as$

A B A A B A A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A

Image of a thin accretion disk around a Schwarzschild BH [Vincent, Paumard, Gourgoulhon & Perrin, CQG 28, 225011 (2011)]

Éric Gourgoulhon (LUTH)

Testing GR via BH observations

Valencia, 16 Dec. 2016 4 / 34

Can we see a black hole from the Earth?



Angular diameter of the silhouette of a Schwarzschild BH of mass M seen from a distance d:

$$\Theta = 6\sqrt{3}\,\frac{GM}{c^2 d} \simeq 2.60 \frac{2R_{\rm S}}{d}$$

Largest black holes in the Earth's sky :

Sgr A* : $\Theta = 53 \ \mu as$ M87 : $\Theta = 21 \ \mu as$ M31 : $\Theta = 20 \ \mu as$

A B A A B A A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A

 $\begin{array}{l} \mbox{Compare : HST resolution} \\ \sim 10^5 \ \mu \mbox{as !} \end{array}$

Image of a thin accretion disk around a Schwarzschild BH [Vincent, Paumard, Gourgoulhon & Perrin, CQG 28, 225011 (2011)]

Can we see a black hole from the Earth?



Image of a thin accretion disk around a Schwarzschild BH [Vincent, Paumard, Gourgoulhon & Perrin, CQG 28, 225011 (2011)] Angular diameter of the silhouette of a Schwarzschild BH of mass M seen from a distance d:

$$\Theta = 6\sqrt{3}\,\frac{GM}{c^2 d} \simeq 2.60 \frac{2R_{\rm S}}{d}$$

Largest black holes in the Earth's sky :

Sgr A* : $\Theta = 53 \ \mu as$ M87 : $\Theta = 21 \ \mu as$ M31 : $\Theta = 20 \ \mu as$

 $\begin{array}{l} \mbox{Compare : HST resolution} \\ \sim 10^5 \ \mu \mbox{as !} \end{array}$

Remark : black holes in X-ray binaries are $\sim 10^5$ times smaller ($\Theta \propto M/d$)

A ID > A ID > A

Éric Gourgoulhon (LUTH)

Testing GR via BH observations

Valencia, 16 Dec. 2016

4 / 34

Reaching the μas resolution with VLBI : the EHT



Very Large Baseline Interferometry (VLBI) in (sub)millimeter waves

Event Horizon Telescope [Doeleman et al. 2011]

Reaching the μas resolution with VLBI : the EHT



Event Horizon Telescope [Doeleman et al. 2011]

Very Large Baseline Interferometry (VLBI) in (sub)millimeter waves

One of the best result so far : VLBI observations at 1.3 mm have shown that the size of the emitting region in Sgr A* is only $37 \ \mu as$ [Doeleman et al., Nature **455**, 78 (2008)]

< 口 > < 同 >

VLBA and EHT observations of M87



[Kino et al., ApJ 803, 30 (2015)]

Near-infrared optical interferometry : GRAVITY



[Gillessen et al. 2010]

GRAVITY instrument at VLTI (2016)

Beam combiner (the four 8 m telescopes + four auxiliary telescopes)

astrometric precision on orbits : $10 \ \mu as$

Near-infrared optical interferometry : GRAVITY



July 2015 : GRAVITY shipped to Chile and successfully assembled at Paranal Observatory

Fall 2016 : observations have started !

[MPE/GRAVITY team]

Outline

- A new observational era
- 2 Testing general relativity with black holes
 - Boson stars
- 4 Black holes with scalar hair
- 5 Conclusion and future prospects

Is general relativity unique?

Yes if we assume

- a 4-dimensional spacetime
- ullet gravitation only described by a metric tensor g
- ullet field equation involving only derivatives of g up to second order
- diffeomorphism invariance
- $\boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \boldsymbol{T} = 0$ (\Longrightarrow weak equivalence principle)

The above is a consequence of Lovelock theorem (1972).

Is general relativity unique?

Yes if we assume

- a 4-dimensional spacetime
- ullet gravitation only described by a metric tensor g
- ullet field equation involving only derivatives of g up to second order
- diffeomorphism invariance
- $\boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \boldsymbol{T} = 0$ (\Longrightarrow weak equivalence principle)

The above is a consequence of Lovelock theorem (1972).

However, GR is certainly not the ultimate theory of gravitation :

- it is not a quantum theory
- cosmological constant / dark energy problem

 ${\sf GR}$ is generally considered as a low-energy limit of a more fundamental theory :

- string theory
- loop quantum gravity

• . . .

Extensions of general relativity



An example : tensor-scalar theory

THE ASTROPHYSICAL JOURNAL, 533:392–405, 2000 April 10 (© 2000. The American Astronomical Society. All rights reserved. Printed in U.S.A.

GRAVITATIONAL WAVES FROM THE COLLAPSE AND BOUNCE OF A STELLAR CORE IN TENSOR-SCALAR GRAVITY

JÉRÔME NOVAK¹ AND JOSÉ M^A. IBÁÑEZ

Departamento de Astronomí a y Astrofísica, Universidad de Valencia, 46100 Burjassot, Spain; Jerome.Novak@obspm.fr Received 1998 December 22; accepted 1999 November 17

ABSTRACT

Tensor-scalar theory of gravity allows the generation of gravitational waves from astrophysical sources, like supernovae, even in the spherical case. That motivated us to study the collapse of a degenerate stellar core, within tensor-scalar gravity, leading to the formation of a neutron star through a bounce and the formation of a shock. This paper discusses the effects of the scalar field on the evolution of the system, as well as the appearance of strong nonperturbative effects of this scalar field (the so-called spontaneous scalarization). As a main result, we describe the resulting gravitational monopolar radiation (form and amplitude) and discuss the possibility of its detection by the gravitational detectors currently under construction, taking into account the existing constraints on the scalar field. From the numerical point of view, it is worthy to point out that we have developed a combined code that uses pseudo-spectral methods for the evolution of the hydrodynamical system. Although this code has been used to integrate the field equations of that theory of gravity, in the spherically symmetric case, a by-product of the present work is to gain experience for an ulterior extension to multidimensional problems in Numerical Relativity of such numerical strategy.

< 口 > < 同 > < 三 > < 三

The link with CoCoNuT : first "Mariage des maillages"

THE ASTROPHYSICAL JOURNAL, 533:392–405, 2000 April 10 © 2000. The American Astronomical Society. All rights reserved. Printed in U.S.A.

GRAVITATIONAL WAVES FROM THE COLLAPSE AND BOUNCE OF A STELLAR CORE IN TENSOR-SCALAR GRAVITY

JÉRÔME NOVAK¹ AND JOSÉ M^A. IBÁÑEZ

Departamento de Astronomí a y Astrofísica, Universidad de Valencia, 46100 Burjassot, Spain; Jerome.Novak@obspm.fr Received 1998 December 22; accepted 1999 November 17

ABSTRACT

Tensor-scalar theory of gravity allows the generation of gravitational waves from astrophysical sources, like supernovae, even in the spherical case. That motivated us to study the collapse of a degenerate stellar core, within tensor-scalar gravity, leading to the formation of a neutron star through a bounce and the formation of a shock. This paper discusses the effects of the scalar field on the evolution of the system, as well as the appearance of strong nonperturbative effects of this scalar field (the so-called spontaneous scalarization). As a main result, we describe the resulting gravitational monopolar radiation (form and amplitude) and discuss the possibility of its detection by the gravitational detectors currently under construction, taking into account the existing constraints on the scalar field. From the numerical point of view, it is worthy to point out that we have developed a combined code that uses pseudo-spectral methods for the evolution of the hydrodynamical system. Although this code has been used to integrate the field equations of that theory of gravity, in the spherically symmetric case, a by-product of the present work is to gain experience for an ulterior extension to multidimensional problems in Numerical Relativity of such numerical strategy.

< 口 > < 同 > < 三 > < 三

Test : are astrophysical black holes Kerr black holes?

- No-hair theorem : $\mathsf{GR} \Longrightarrow \mathsf{Kerr} \mathsf{BH}$
- $\bullet\,$ extension of GR \Longrightarrow BH may deviate from Kerr

Test : are astrophysical black holes Kerr black holes?

- No-hair theorem : $\mathsf{GR} \Longrightarrow \mathsf{Kerr} \mathsf{BH}$
- $\bullet\,$ extension of GR \Longrightarrow BH may deviate from Kerr

Observational tests

Search for

- stellar orbits deviating from Kerr timelike geodesics (GRAVITY)
- accretion disk spectra different from those arising in Kerr metric (X-ray observatories, e.g. Athena)
- images of the black hole silhouette different from that of a Kerr BH (EHT)

Image: A matrix

Test : are astrophysical black holes Kerr black holes?

- No-hair theorem : $\mathsf{GR} \Longrightarrow \mathsf{Kerr} \mathsf{BH}$
- $\bullet\,$ extension of GR \Longrightarrow BH may deviate from Kerr

Observational tests

Search for

- stellar orbits deviating from Kerr timelike geodesics (GRAVITY)
- accretion disk spectra different from those arising in Kerr metric (X-ray observatories, e.g. Athena)
- images of the black hole silhouette different from that of a Kerr BH (EHT)

Need for a good and versatile geodesic integrator

to compute timelike geodesics (orbits) and null geodesics (ray-tracing) in any kind of metric

Gyoto code

Main developers : T. Paumard & F. Vincent



- Integration of geodesics in Kerr metric
- Integration of geodesics in any numerically computed 3+1 metric
- Radiative transfer included in optically thin media
- Very modular code (C++)
- Python interface

• Free software (GPL) : http://gyoto.obspm.fr/

[Vincent, Paumard, Gourgoulhon & Perrin, CQG 28, 225011 (2011)]
[Vincent, Gourgoulhon & Novak, CQG 29, 245005 (2012)]

Testing GR via BH observations

Measuring the spin from the black hole silhouette

Ray-tracing in the Kerr metric (spin parameter a)

Accretion structure around Sgr A* modelled as a ion torus, derived from the *polish doughnut* class [Abramowicz, Jaroszynski & Sikora (1978)]



Radiative processes included : thermal synchrotron, bremsstrahlung, inverse Compton

- $\leftarrow \text{ Image of an ion torus} \\ \text{computed with Gyoto for the} \\ \text{inclination angle } i = 80^\circ:$
 - black : a = 0.5M
 - red : a = 0.9M

[Straub, Vincent, Abramowicz, Gourgoulhon & Paumard, A&A 543, A83 (2012)]

Outline

- A new observational era
- 2 Testing general relativity with black holes

Boson stars

- 4 Black holes with scalar hair
- 5 Conclusion and future prospects

Boson stars

Boson star = localized configurations of a self-gravitating complex scalar field $\Phi \equiv$ "Klein-Gordon geons" [Bonazzola & Pacini (1966), Kaup (1968), Ruffini & Bonazzola (1969)]

- Minimally coupled scalar field : $\mathcal{L} = \frac{1}{16\pi}R \frac{1}{2}\left[\nabla_{\mu}\bar{\Phi}\nabla^{\mu}\Phi + V(|\Phi|^2)\right]$
- Field equation : $abla_{\mu}
 abla^{\mu} \Phi = V'(|\Phi|^2) \Phi$
- Einstein equation : $R_{\alpha\beta} \frac{1}{2}Rg_{\alpha\beta} = 8\pi T_{\alpha\beta}$

with $T_{\alpha\beta} = \nabla_{(\alpha} \bar{\Phi} \nabla_{\beta)} \Phi - \frac{1}{2} \left[\nabla_{\mu} \bar{\Phi} \nabla^{\mu} \Phi + V(|\Phi|^2) \right] g_{\alpha\beta}$

Boson stars

Boson star = localized configurations of a self-gravitating complex scalar field $\Phi \equiv$ "Klein-Gordon geons" [Bonazzola & Pacini (1966), Kaup (1968), Ruffini & Bonazzola (1969)]

- Minimally coupled scalar field : $\mathcal{L} = \frac{1}{16\pi}R \frac{1}{2}\left[\nabla_{\mu}\bar{\Phi}\nabla^{\mu}\Phi + V(|\Phi|^2)\right]$
- Field equation : $abla_{\mu}
 abla^{\mu} \Phi = V'(|\Phi|^2) \Phi$
- Einstein equation : $R_{\alpha\beta} \frac{1}{2}Rg_{\alpha\beta} = 8\pi T_{\alpha\beta}$

with
$$T_{\alpha\beta} = \nabla_{(\alpha} \bar{\Phi} \nabla_{\beta)} \Phi - \frac{1}{2} \left[\nabla_{\mu} \bar{\Phi} \nabla^{\mu} \Phi + V(|\Phi|^2) \right] g_{\alpha\beta}$$

Examples :

• free field : $V(|\Phi|^2) = \frac{m^2}{\hbar^2} |\Phi|^2$, m : boson mass

 \implies field equation = Klein-Gordon equation : $\nabla_{\mu}\nabla^{\mu}\Phi = \frac{m^2}{\hbar^2}\Phi$

• a standard self-interacting field : $V(|\Phi|^2) = \frac{m^2}{\hbar^2} |\Phi|^2 + \lambda |\Phi|^4$

Boson stars

Boson star = localized configurations of a self-gravitating complex scalar field $\Phi \equiv$ "Klein-Gordon geons" [Bonazzola & Pacini (1966), Kaup (1968), Ruffini & Bonazzola (1969)]

- Minimally coupled scalar field : $\mathcal{L} = \frac{1}{16\pi}R \frac{1}{2}\left[\nabla_{\mu}\bar{\Phi}\nabla^{\mu}\Phi + V(|\Phi|^2)\right]$
- Field equation : $abla_{\mu}
 abla^{\mu} \Phi = V'(|\Phi|^2) \Phi$
- Einstein equation : $R_{\alpha\beta} \frac{1}{2}Rg_{\alpha\beta} = 8\pi T_{\alpha\beta}$

with
$$T_{\alpha\beta} = \nabla_{(\alpha} \bar{\Phi} \nabla_{\beta)} \Phi - \frac{1}{2} \left[\nabla_{\mu} \bar{\Phi} \nabla^{\mu} \Phi + V(|\Phi|^2) \right] g_{\alpha\beta}$$

Examples :

• free field : $V(|\Phi|^2) = \frac{m^2}{\hbar^2} |\Phi|^2$, m : boson mass

 \implies field equation = Klein-Gordon equation : $\nabla_{\mu}\nabla^{\mu}\Phi = \frac{m^2}{\hbar^2}\Phi$

• a standard self-interacting field : $V(|\Phi|^2) = \frac{m^2}{\hbar^2} |\Phi|^2 + \lambda |\Phi|^4$

Boson stars as black-hole mimickers

Boson stars can be very compact and are the less exotic alternative to black holes : they require only a scalar field and since 2012 we know that at least one fundamental scalar field exists in Nature : the Higgs boson !

Boson stars as black-hole mimickers

Boson stars can be very compact and are the less exotic alternative to black holes : they require only a scalar field and since 2012 we know that at least one fundamental scalar field exists in Nature : the Higgs boson !

Maximum mass

• Free field :
$$M_{
m max} = lpha rac{\hbar}{m} = lpha rac{m_{
m P}^2}{m}$$
, with $lpha \sim 1$

• Self-interacting field : $M_{\rm max} \sim \left(\frac{\lambda}{4\pi}\right)$

$$\int_{-\infty}^{1/2} \frac{m_{\rm P}^2}{m} imes \frac{m_{\rm P}}{m}$$

 $m_{\rm P} = \sqrt{\hbar} = \sqrt{\hbar c/G} = 2.18 \ 10^{-8} \ {\rm kg}$: Planck mass

Boson stars as black-hole mimickers

Boson stars can be very compact and are the less exotic alternative to black holes : they require only a scalar field and since 2012 we know that at least one fundamental scalar field exists in Nature : the Higgs boson !

Maximum mass

• Free field :
$$M_{
m max}=lpharac{\hbar}{m}=lpharac{m_{
m P}^2}{m}$$
 , with $lpha\sim 1$

• Self-interacting field : $M_{\rm max} \sim \left(\frac{\lambda}{4\pi}\right)^{-1}$

$$\left(\frac{\lambda}{4\pi}\right)^{1/2} \frac{m_{\rm P}^2}{m} imes \frac{m_{\rm F}}{m}$$

 $m_{\rm P}=\sqrt{\hbar}=\sqrt{\hbar c/G}=2.18\;10^{-8}\;{\rm kg}$: Planck mass

m	$M_{ m max}$ (free field)	$M_{ m max}$ ($\lambda = 1$)
125 GeV (Higgs)	$2 \ 10^9 \ \mathrm{kg}$	$2 \ 10^{26} \ \mathrm{kg}$
$1 { m GeV}$	$3 \; 10^{11} \; \mathrm{kg}$	$2M_{\odot}$
$0.5 { m MeV}$	$3\;10^{14}\;\mathrm{kg}$	$5\;10^6M_{\odot}$

Éric Gourgoulhon (LUTH)

Rotating boson stars

Ansatz for stationary and axisymmetric spacetimes [Schunck & Mielke (1996)] :

 $\Phi(t, r, \theta, \varphi) = \Phi_0(r, \theta) e^{i(\omega t + k\varphi)}$

with $\Phi_0(r, \theta)$ real function, $\omega \in \mathbb{R}$ and $k \in \mathbb{N}$ (regularity on the rotation axis) Solutions :

- k = 0 : static and spherically symmetric boson stars
 - \implies exterior spacetime = Schwarzschild (or close to it if Φ never vanishes)
- $k \ge 1$: stationary rotating "stars" with toroidal topology
 - \Longrightarrow exterior spacetime expected to be significantly different from Kerr



 $\begin{array}{ccc} & \leftarrow \mbox{ Profile of } \Phi_0(r,\theta) \mbox{ for a free field with} \\ 0\,.\,05 & k=2 \end{array}$

z-axis = rotation axis : $z = r \cos \theta$, $x = r \sin \theta \cos \varphi$

[Yoshida & Eriguchi, PRD 56, 762 (1997)]

A B A B A
 A
 B
 A
 A
 B
 A
 A
 B
 A
 A
 B
 A
 A
 B
 A
 A
 B
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A

Rotating boson stars

Solutions computed by means of Kadath [Grandclément, JCP 229, 3334 (2010)] http://luth.obspm.fr/~luthier/grandclement/kadath.html

Isocontours of $\Phi_0(r,\theta)$ in the plane $\varphi = 0$ for $\omega = 0.8 \frac{m}{\hbar}$:



Éric Gourgoulhon (LUTH)

Testing GR via BH observations

Zero-angular momentum orbits around rotating boson stars



[Granclément, Somé & Gourgoulhon, PRD 90, 024068 (2014)]

Zero-angular momentum orbits around rotating boson stars



[Granclément, Somé & Gourgoulhon, PRD 90, 024068 (2014)]

No equivalent in Kerr spacetime

Éric Gourgoulhon (LUTH)

Testing GR via BH observations

Valencia, 16 Dec. 2016

22 / 34

Image of an accretion torus

Kerr BH a/M = 0.9



Boson star $k = 1, \omega = 0.70 m/\hbar$



イロト イロト イヨト イヨト

[Vincent, Meliani, Grandclément, Gourgoulhon & Straub, CQG 33, 105015 (2016)]

Éric Gourgoulhon (LUTH)

Testing GR via BH observations

Valencia, 16 Dec. 2016 23 / 34

Strong light bending in rotating boson star spacetimes



[Vincent, Meliani, Grandclément, Gourgoulhon & Straub, CQG 33, 105015 (2016)]

Outline

- A new observational era
- 2 Testing general relativity with black holes
- Boson stars
- 4 Black holes with scalar hair
- 5 Conclusion and future prospects

Herdeiro-Radu hairy black holes

Herdeiro & Radu discovery (2014)

A black hole can have a complex scalar hair

Stationary axisymmetric configuration with a self-gravitating massive complex scalar field Φ and an event horizon

$$\begin{split} \Phi(t,r,\theta,\varphi) &= \Phi_0(r,\theta) e^{i(\omega t + k\varphi)} \\ \omega &= k \Omega_{\rm H} \end{split}$$



[Herdeiro & Radu, PRL 112, 221101 (2014)]

Herdeiro-Radu hairy black holes

- Configuration I : rather Kerr-like
- Configuration II : not so Kerr-like
- Configuration III : very non-Kerr-like





[Cunha, Herdeiro, Radu Rúnarsson, PRL 115, 211102 (2015)]

TABLE I. KBHsSH configurations considered in the present study. M is the ADM mass, $M_{\rm H}$ is the horizon's Komar mass, J is the total Komar angular momentum and $J_{\rm H}$ is the horizon's Komar angular momentum.

	М	$M_{\rm H}$	J	$J_{ m H}$	$\frac{M_{\rm H}}{M}$	$\frac{J_{\rm H}}{J}$	$\frac{J}{M^2}$	$rac{J_{\mathrm{H}}}{M_{\mathrm{H}}^2}$
Configuration I	$0.415\mathcal{M}$	$0.393\mathcal{M}$	$0.172 \mathcal{M}^2$	$0.150\mathcal{M}^2$	95%	87%	0.999	0.971
Configuration II	$0.933\mathcal{M}$	$0.234\mathcal{M}$	$0.740 M^{2}$	$0.115M^{2}$	25%	15%	0.850	2.10
Configuration III	$0.975\mathcal{M}$	$0.018\mathcal{M}$	$0.85\mathcal{M}^2$	$0.002\mathcal{M}^2$	1.8%	2.4%	0.894	6.20
Éric Gourgoulhon (LUTH)		Testing GR via BH observations				Valencia, 16 Dec. 2016		

Images of a magnetized accretion torus

Accretion torus model of [Vincent, Yan, Straub, Zdziarski & Abramowicz, A&A 574, A48 (2015)]

- non-self-gravitating perfect fluid
- polytropic EOS $\gamma=5/3$
- constant specific angular momentum $\ell = u_\varphi/(-u_t) = 3.6\,M$

[Abramowicz, Jaroszynski & Sikora, A&A 63, 221 (1978)]

- torus inner radius $r_{\rm in} \simeq 5.5 \, M$
- max electron density : $n_{\rm e} = 6.3 \; 10^{12} \; {\rm m}^{-3}$
- max electron temperature : $T_{\rm e} = 5.3 \ 10^{10} \ {\rm K}$
- isotropized magnetic field \implies synchrotron radiation
- \bullet gas-to-magnetic pressure ration $\beta=10$
- observer inclination angle : $\theta=85^\circ$



Configuration I Gyoto-simulated images of Sgr A* at f = 250 GHz



[Vincent, Gourgoulhon, Herdeiro & Radu, PRD 94, 084045 (2016)]

Configuration I Gyoto-simulated images of Sgr A* at f = 250 GHz



Éric Gourgoulhon (LUTH)

Testing GR via BH observations

Valencia, 16 Dec. 2016 29 / 34

Configuration II Gyoto-simulated images of Sgr A* at f = 250 GHz



[Vincent, Gourgoulhon, Herdeiro & Radu, PRD 94, 084045 (2016)]

Configuration II Gyoto-simulated images of Sgr A* at f = 250 GHz



[Vincent, Gourgoulhon, Herdeiro & Radu, PRD 94, 084045 (2016)]

Configuration II Gyoto-simulated images of Sgr A* at f = 250 GHz



Éric Gourgoulhon (LUTH)

Testing GR via BH observations

Configuration III Gyoto-simulated images of Sgr A* at f = 250 GHz



[Vincent, Gourgoulhon, Herdeiro & Radu, PRD 94, 084045 (2016)]

Configuration III Gyoto-simulated images of Sgr A* at f = 250 GHz



Éric Gourgoulhon (LUTH)

Testing GR via BH observations

32 / 34

Outline

- A new observational era
- 2 Testing general relativity with black holes
- 3 Boson stars
- 4 Black holes with scalar hair
- **5** Conclusion and future prospects

Conclusion and future prospects

After a century marked by the Golden Age (1965-1975), the first astronomical discoveries (1970-80's) and the ubiquity of black holes in high-energy astrophysics (1990's - present), black hole physics is entering a new observational era, with the advent of high-angular-resolution telescopes and gravitational wave detectors, which provide unique opportunities to test general relativity in the strong field regime.

< 口 > < 同 >

Conclusion and future prospects

After a century marked by the Golden Age (1965-1975), the first astronomical discoveries (1970-80's) and the ubiquity of black holes in high-energy astrophysics (1990's - present), black hole physics is entering a new observational era, with the advent of high-angular-resolution telescopes and gravitational wave detectors, which provide unique opportunities to test general relativity in the strong field regime.

We have investigated two alternatives to the Kerr black hole *within general relativity* : boson stars and black holes with scalar hair. Both show distinctive features, within the range of GRAVITY and EHT instruments.

A B A A B A A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A

Conclusion and future prospects

After a century marked by the Golden Age (1965-1975), the first astronomical discoveries (1970-80's) and the ubiquity of black holes in high-energy astrophysics (1990's - present), black hole physics is entering a new observational era, with the advent of high-angular-resolution telescopes and gravitational wave detectors, which provide unique opportunities to test general relativity in the strong field regime.

We have investigated two alternatives to the Kerr black hole *within general relativity* : boson stars and black holes with scalar hair. Both show distinctive features, within the range of GRAVITY and EHT instruments.

Future prospects

- Obtain rotating black hole solutions in extensions to GR, such as Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet gravity with dilaton [Kleihaus, Kunz & Radu, PRL 106, 151104 (2011)] and Chern-Simons gravity
- Compute orbits and accretion disk/torus images and compare with Kerr BH